DUE DILIGENCE: CHOOSING A PHYSICAL GOLD ETP

MAY 2019

Of all the precious metals, gold is the most popular as an investment. It has long been regarded as a potential portfolio diversifier due to its low correlation to the economy and other financial assets, hedge against extreme political events and market turmoil, and a safe haven during periods of low real interest rates and high monetary expansion.

However, it is extremely scarce. Above ground stocks are estimated to be around 180,000 metric tons which, if distributed equally to everyone in the world, would equate to less than 1-oz per person.¹

There are several ways to add gold to a portfolio:

It’s important to consider that there are two markets driving ETP liquidity—the secondary and the primary. We’ll start by explaining the secondary market first because this is the market you’re most likely to be more familiar with:

- Gold can be held physically;
- Via exchange traded products (ETPs), many of which are physically backed by gold;
- By using sophisticated derivatives such as gold futures; or
- By holding gold mining equities, which are affected by gold prices

Given their surge in popularity over the last decade, this piece will focus on physically backed ETPs, with the aim of providing investors with guiding criteria for benchmarking whether a specific gold ETP structure is ‘best of breed’. It is important that investors understand the differences between individual gold ETPs to ensure the product they are considering investing in will intrinsically meet their investment goals. We believe that the robustness of the structures and processes that govern physically backed gold ETPs are key to selecting a vehicle that holds physical gold.

¹ Thomson Reuters GFMS, World Bank, WisdomTree.
5 KEY CONSIDERATIONS OF PHYSICALLY BACKED ETP

A strict due diligence process should encompass five key areas:

- **SECURITY**
  - The ETP must be backed by physical bullion.
  - To act as secure investments, physically-backed ETPs need to be backed by physical LBMA (London Bullion Market Association) “Good Delivery” gold bullion held mainly in allocated accounts owned by the issuer (with allowances for small amounts to be unallocated for the operational purposes of creation and redemption).
  - Neither cash, nor certificates representing the right to receive bullion, should be a substitute for physical bullion.
  - Neither the issuer, the custodian nor any other counterparty should be lending, leasing, trading or pledging as collateral bullion held in the allocated account.
  - Audits and bar lists should be verifiable against the LBMA ‘Good Delivery’ list.
  - Bullion should be kept in fortified, high-security vaults specifically designed for bullion storage.
  - Investors should not be exposed to any credit risk towards the issuer or the custodian or any other counterparty.
  - The issuer should be a separate, bankruptcy-remote entity (all the bullion should be segregated from the issuer’s other assets and liabilities).
  - Bullion should be identified as owned by the issuer and held in allocated form, and, as a result, be segregated from any other assets held by the custodian (both physically and in its books and records).

---

2 Thomson Reuters GFMS, World Bank, WisdomTree.
TRANSPARENCY
Published bullion holdings and clearly identified parties are essential.

Independent counterparties
Physically-backed ETPs should have independent authorised participants, market makers, custodians and a trustee acting on behalf of investors’ best interests. Such independence has long been a hallmark of good corporate governance for the fund management industry; this increases transparency and reduces any potential conflicts of interest.

Transparent pricing
The ratio of the security’s Net Asset Value to the London Gold PM fix should be stable (reflecting only the historical cost) and easy to calculate; this allows market makers to efficiently trade the product and provide best prices and execution to the market. The expected return of the product should roughly be the Gold Spot Price less the Management Fee.

Easily understandable fee structure
Fees should be clearly identified, broken down and their impact on the Net Asset Value should be easy to calculate.

Reliable audit procedures
The issuer’s allocated account should be audited by both the custodian’s own rigorous internal audit procedures and by an independent LBMA-approved, independent bullion assayer. The Audit procedure should consist of semi-annual audits, at least one of which should be random and encompass both a physical inspection of the vault and a reconciliation of the bullion with both the custodian’s and the issuer’s records.

Daily bar list
Both the issuer and investors should receive updated account statements of the bullion backing the ETPs.

+ The custodian should provide the issuer with a bar list, updated daily for creations and redemptions, showing recognisable identifiers for each bar held. These generally comprise brand name, serial number, weight and assay. These should be available to investors.

+ The procedures improve transparency and provide that the product is 100% backed by LBMA ‘Good Delivery’ bars.
**COST EFFICIENCY**

*Product structure should be as cost efficient as possible*

**Multiple authorised participants (APs)**

The structure should allow for multiple APs to reduce tracking error. Products with only one AP may trade at a premium as there are no independent arbitrageurs ensuring that prices remain consistent with the underlying physical gold price.

**Multiple market makers (MMs)**

The structure should allow for multiple MMs to provide liquidity, reduce spreads and encourage fair pricing of the ETP. Multiple market makers and APs also reduce operational risk in the event any one AP or MM is no longer able to participate in the market.

**Physical delivery**

For maximum security and liquidity the physical redemption should be in the form of London ‘Good Delivery’ bars delivered to an allocated or unallocated LBMA account and should be within t+3\(^1\) framework. Physical delivery should not be restricted or limited in quantity. Investors and/or authorised participants must be able to redeem 100% of their physical gold holdings in a single transaction.

**Cash redemption**

If allowed, this should not involve unnecessary costs.

---

\(^1\) Refers to the settlement dates of security transactions that occur on a transaction date plus three days.
LIQUIDITY

Liquidity is the measure of the tradability of a product. It is an important consideration when determining the differences between products because more liquid products will be more competitively priced. This is even more important in volatile markets when the need to enter/exit a trade at a competitive price is paramount.

All physical gold ETPs have similar access to the underlying gold so the primary market impact of creating and redeeming ETP units should be similar. However, this is not the case when one looks at secondary market liquidity.

Secondary market liquidity, especially liquidity displayed on exchange, can differ significantly between ETPs. The key measures of liquidity are the bid/offer spread, the “depth” of the order book (the number of orders) and the number of market makers.

- Bid/Offer spread – the difference between the best (lowest) price at which the ETP can be bought and the best (highest) price it can be sold at in a given moment.
- Orderbook depth – The size, price and number of orders within the orderbook. The higher the amount of units that can be bought (sold) at a competitive price the better.
- Market makers – Market makers compete to provide the best prices in the orderbook. Generally, the larger the number the more competitive the spread.

All of these measures combine together produce a liquid product, which can be especially important during times of market stress (see Figure 1). Market makers are drawn to products with high volumes. More market makers equal tighter spreads and more levels of order in the orderbook as they compete to provide the best price.

The same principle is valid for over the counter (OTC) trading. The higher the number of market makers for a product the more competitive the pricing of the product will be.

FIGURE 1: BREXIT REFERENDUM RESULT DAY, 24 JUNE 2016: BID-ASK SPREADS FOR EUROPEAN PHYSICAL GOLD ETPS

Source: Bloomberg, as of 24 June 2016. Bid-Ask Spread data was collated at -5 basis points (bps) to allow visual representation of the upside. Lowest level reached is -1,051. **Historical performance is not an indication of future performance and any investments may go down in value.**
**PHYSICAL HOLDINGS QUALITY**

LBMA-approved London ‘Good Delivery’ bars are paramount. Physically-backed ETPs should provide access to bullion with the security, reliability and strength of the London wholesale OTC bullion market, therefore the bullion should be held in the form of London ‘Good Delivery’ bars. This is a critical point as non LBMA ‘Good Delivery’ bars cannot be sold in the London OTC market.

The custodian should be a member firm of the LBMA

Custodians that trade in these markets have vaults that are internationally-recognised as meeting required standards for security and storage space.

**Bullion should be LBMA ‘Good Delivery’ bars**

+ These bars have a set number of ounces and a required fineness (purity) of 99.5%. They must bear the stamp of an LBMA-approved smelter/assayer.
+ They are the only bars permitted for delivery in the London OTC market.
+ Bullion held loco London is the most liquid. If held anywhere else (e.g. loco Zurich), bullion should be held with a custodian or sub-custodian who is an LBMA member.
+ Holding gold bullion outside London may result in metal trading at a premium or a discount to the London fixing price.
+ Creating outside London may also require a loco swap with London; in the event of a shortage of metal, the swap price could increase dramatically.

**TRACK RECORD**

Physically-backed gold ETPs are unique in the exchange traded products world; unlike all other financial products they involve the management and the custody of a physical asset: gold bullion. It is essential that investors’ carefully study the track record of the issuer and assess whether it perfectly understands the mechanics and the need for security of the precious metals market.

Therefore, it is crucial that all the participants involved in the management of the product, such as custodian, registrar, and trustee, are independent from each other and possess a proven track record fulfilling their respective roles. In addition, for any exchange traded product, liquidity is paramount. A competitive product should be supported by a network of liquidity providers (authorised participants and market makers), to ensure tight bid/offer spreads and an efficient creation/redemption processes. This then provides depth for the largest institutional capital flows. Products with single or limited APs should be avoided.

**RELATED PRODUCTS**

+ **ETFS Physical Gold**
+ **Gold Bullion Securities**

---

4 Loco London: gold bullion physically held in London
5 Loco Zurich: gold bullion physically held in Zurich
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Due diligence checklist</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Security</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fully backed by physical bullion held mainly in an allocated account</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No lending of, or borrowing against bullion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bankruptcy-remote issuer with segregated assets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No credit risk to the custodian</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited operational risk</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No new ETPs can be issued without the prior delivery of gold to the issuer’s gold account with the custodian</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transparency</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All major counterparties are independent (APs, custodian, MMs, trustee, registrar, auditors and issuer)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparent and simple pricing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easily understandable fee structure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliable audit procedures that are published, including at least one random audit of the custodian’s vault</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Published bar lists with unique LBMA identifiers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost-efficiency</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple APs to ensure arbitrage opportunities and encourage fair pricing of the ETP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple market makers to ensure maximum liquidity and reduce spreads</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tight spreads and minimal tracking error</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical holdings quality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LBMA ‘Good Delivery’ bars</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Held with a member firm of the LBMA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Held by a Custodian who is a loco London clearer, in vaults that meet required standards for security and size</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Track record</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issuer has long operating track record under different market conditions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partners are all highly experienced in their respective fields</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fund size is sufficient and reflects wide acceptance among investors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IMPORTANT INFORMATION

Communications issued in the European Economic Area (“EEA”): This document has been issued and approved by WisdomTree Ireland Limited, which is authorised and regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland.

Communications issued in jurisdictions outside of the EEA: This document has been issued and approved by WisdomTree UK Limited, which is authorised and regulated by the United Kingdom Financial Conduct Authority.

WisdomTree Ireland Limited and WisdomTree UK Limited are each referred to as “WisdomTree” (as applicable). Our Conflicts of Interest Policy and Inventory are available on request.

For professional clients only. Past performance is not a reliable indicator of future performance. Any historical performance included in this document may be based on back testing. Back testing is the process of evaluating an investment strategy by applying it to historical data to simulate what the performance of such strategy would have been. Back tested performance is purely hypothetical and is provided in this document solely for informational purposes. Back tested data does not represent actual performance and should not be interpreted as an indication of actual or future performance. The value of any investment may be affected by exchange rate movements. Any decision to invest should be based on the information contained in the appropriate prospectus and after seeking independent investment, tax and legal advice. These products may not be available in your market or suitable for you. The content of this document does not constitute investment advice nor an offer for sale nor a solicitation of an offer to buy any product or make any investment.

An investment in exchange-traded products (“ETPs”) is dependent on the performance of the underlying index, less costs, but it is not expected to match that performance precisely. ETPs involve numerous risks including among others, general market risks relating to the relevant underlying index, credit risks on the provider of index swaps utilised in the ETP, exchange rate risks, interest rate risks, inflationary risks, liquidity risks and legal and regulatory risks.

The information contained in this document is not, and under no circumstances is to be construed as, an advertisement or any other step in furtherance of a public offering of shares in the United States or any province or territory thereof, where none of the issuers or their products are authorised or registered for distribution and where no prospectus of any of the issuers has been filed with any securities commission or regulatory authority. No document or information in this document should be taken, transmitted or distributed (directly or indirectly) into the United States. None of the issuers, nor any securities issued by them, have been or will be registered under the United States Securities Act of 1933 or the Investment Company Act of 1940 or qualified under any applicable state securities statutes.

This document may contain independent market commentary prepared by WisdomTree based on publicly available information. Although WisdomTree endeavours to ensure the accuracy of the content in this document, WisdomTree does not warrant or guarantee its accuracy or correctness. Any third party data providers used to source the information in this document make no warranties or representation of any kind relating to such data. Where WisdomTree has expressed its own opinions related to product or market activity, these views may change. Neither WisdomTree, nor any affiliate, nor any of their respective officers, directors, partners, or employees accepts any liability whatsoever for any direct or consequential loss arising from any use of this document or its contents.

This document may contain forward looking statements including statements regarding our belief or current expectations with regards to the performance of certain assets classes and/or sectors. Forward looking statements are subject to certain risks, uncertainties and assumptions. There can be no assurance that such statements will be accurate and actual results could differ materially from those anticipated in such statements. WisdomTree strongly recommends that you do not place undue reliance on these forward-looking statements.
The products discussed in this document are issued by ETFS Metal Securities Limited and Gold Bullion Securities Limited (the “Issuer”). The Issuer is regulated by the Jersey Financial Services Commission. Investors should read the prospectus of the Issuer before investing and should refer to the section of the prospectus entitled ‘Risk Factors’ for further details of risks associated with an investment in the securities offered by the Issuer.

**ETFS Metal Securities Limited Issuer**

Securities issued by the Issuer are direct, limited recourse obligations of the Issuer alone and are not obligations of or guaranteed by any of HSBC Bank plc and JP Morgan Chase Bank, N.A. any of their affiliates or anyone else or any of their affiliates. Each of HSBC Bank plc and JP Morgan Chase Bank, N.A. disclaims all and any liability whether arising in tort, contract or otherwise which it might have in respect of this document or its contents otherwise arising in connection herewith.

**Gold Bullion Securities Limited Issuer**

Securities issued by the Issuer are direct, limited recourse obligations of the Issuer alone and are not obligations of or guaranteed by HSBC Bank plc, any of their affiliates or anyone else or any of their affiliates. HSBC Bank plc disclaims all and any liability whether arising in tort, contract or otherwise (save as referred to above) which it might have in respect of this document or its contents otherwise arising in connection herewith.

**In Switzerland, this communication is only targeted at Regulated Qualified Investors.**

This communication is only intended for duly registered banks and/or licensed portfolio management companies in Monaco. This communication must not be sent to the public in Monaco.